

A Powerful Opportunity

Making Renewable Electricity the Standard

Steven L. Clemmer

Alan Noguee

Michael C. Brower

Union of Concerned Scientists

January 1999

© Copyright 1999 Union of Concerned Scientists

All rights reserved.

Steven L. Clemmer is a Senior Energy Analyst for the Union of Concerned Scientists. **Alan Noguee** is the Director of the UCS Energy Program. **Michael C. Brower** is the President of Brower and Co. Energy and Environmental Consulting in Andover Massachusetts.

The Union of Concerned Scientists (UCS) is dedicated to advancing responsible public policies in areas where science and technology play a critical role. Established in 1969, UCS has created a unique alliance between many of the nation's leading scientists and thousands of committed citizens. This partnership addresses the most serious environmental and security threats facing humanity. UCS is currently working to encourage responsible stewardship of the global environment and life-sustaining resources; promote energy technologies that are renewable, safe, and cost effective; reform transportation policy; curtail weapons proliferation; and promote sustainable agriculture. An independent nonprofit organization, UCS conducts technical studies and public education, and seeks to influence government policy at the local, state, federal, and international levels.

The UCS Energy Program focuses on developing a sustainable energy system—one that is affordable and nondepletable, and that does not degrade natural systems or public health. The program analyzes, develops, and promotes innovative technology- and market-based strategies to commercialize renewable energy technologies, and provides information to policymakers, the media, and the public about energy's impact on public health, the environment, and the economy.

More information about UCS and the Energy Program is available at the UCS site on the World Wide Web, at www.ucsusa.org.

Copies of this report are available from

UCS Publications
Two Brattle Square
Cambridge, MA 02238-9105

Or call 617-547-5552.

Printed on recycled paper.

Acknowledgements

We are grateful for the insightful comments and suggestions made by the following individuals who served as peer reviewers for the draft report: Steve Bernow, Bruce Biewald, Dallas Burtraw, Jack Cadogan, Brent Haddad, Rick Morgan, Sam Napolitano, Karen Palmer, Ben Paulos, Brian Parsons, Kevin Porter, Nancy Rader, and Ryan Wiser. We are especially grateful for the technical assistance, information and comments provided to us by Mary Hutzler, Director of the Office of Integrated Analysis and Forecasting at the Energy Information Administration and her staff: Alan Beamon, Roger Diedrich, Jeff Jones, Tom Petersik, Scott Sitzler and Peter Whitman. While we have made diligent efforts to accurately reflect the reviewer's comments, the Union of Concerned Scientists takes sole responsibility for the results, conclusions and any errors contained in this report.

We would also like to acknowledge the assistance of our colleagues at UCS. Paul Jefferiss and Warren Leon provided important guidance and comments for this research. Anita Spiess made valuable editorial suggestions and spent many hours editing and proofreading the manuscript. Jon Howland also provided valuable support in producing and formatting the report.

This report was supported by the Energy Foundation, the Joyce Foundation, the McKnight Foundation and the Office of Utility Technologies, United States Department of Energy under grant number DE-FG41-95R110853. The Union of Concerned Scientists is solely responsible for its contents.

NOTICE

This report was prepared as an account of work sponsored by an agency of the United States government. Neither the United States government nor any agency thereof, nor any of their employees, makes any warranty, express or implied, or assumes any legal liability or responsibility for the accuracy, completeness, or usefulness of any information, apparatus, product, or process disclosed, or represents that its use would not infringe privately owned rights. Reference herein to any specific commercial product, process, or service by trade name, trademark, manufacturer, or otherwise does not necessarily constitute or imply its endorsement, recommendation, or favoring by the United States government or any agency thereof. The views and opinions of authors expressed herein do not necessarily state or reflect those of the United States government or any agency thereof.

Contents

Executive Summary	ix
The Federal RPS Proposals	2
Targets and Ramp-Up Period.....	3
Eligible Renewables	4
Entities Required to Meet the Standard.....	4
Duration of the Standard	4
Administration.....	4
Other Provisions	4
Method and Assumptions	6
Assumptions	6
Model Features	8
Calculating the Costs of the RPS	10
Limitations of the Method.....	11
Results	13
National Results	13
Regional Results.....	24
Key Impacts of the Schaefer and Bumpers RPS Proposals.....	27
Comparison with Other Studies	29
Conclusions	35

Figures

1.	Average Consumer Electricity Prices	13
2.	Average Monthly Electricity Bill for a Typical Nonelectric Heating Household	14
3.	Electricity Generator Gas Prices.....	16
4.	Change in Average Monthly Electricity and Natural Gas Bills for a Natural Gas Heating Household.....	16
5.	Net Cost of the Jeffords, Markey, and Administration RPS Proposals.....	17
6.	Average Renewable Energy Credit Price	18
7.	Shortfall in Renewable Generation under the Administration RPS Price Cap ...	19
8.	Carbon Dioxide Emissions from Electricity Generators	21
9.	The Cost of Reducing Carbon Dioxide Emissions	22
10.	Breakdown of Total Nonhydro Renewable Generation in 2020	23
11.	Contribution to New Generation, 1997–2020	24
12.	North American Electric Reliability Council (NERC) Regions.....	25
13.	Administration RPS Renewable Energy Generation	25
14.	Markey RPS Renewable Energy Generation.....	26
15.	Jeffords RPS Renewable Energy Generation	26
16.	Net Cost of the RPS with Total Natural Gas Savings	28
17.	Electricity Generator Gas Prices Under an RPS of 10 Percent in 2010	32

Tables

1.	Renewable Portfolio Standards Included in Federal Legislation	3
2.	Average Monthly Electricity Bill for a Typical Household	15
3.	Comparison of the Nonhydro Renewable Share of Total Generation Under Base Case Projections	29
4.	Renewable Energy Credit Prices and Electricity and Natural Gas Price Impacts in 2010 for Six RPS Studies	31
5.	Comparison of Electricity Sector CO ₂ Emission Levels and Reductions in 2010 for Six RPS Studies	33
6.	The Cost of CO ₂ Reduced Under an RPS of 10 Percent in 2010.....	34