

Cattle, Cleared Forests, and Climate

*Scoring Global Beef Buyers on Their
Deforestation Commitments and Practices*
www.ucsusa.org/beefscorecard

Appendix: Methodology

© September 2016
All rights reserved

Methodology

COMPANY SELECTIONS

We selected companies for the scorecard by identifying the largest companies in three sectors: retail, fast food, and manufacturing. Of these companies, we narrowed the list to those confirmed to purchase beef from South America. We confirmed this through independent research and through correspondence with the company. Thirteen companies were thus selected for evaluation in the scorecard.

For companies in the **manufacturing sector**, we looked at the largest companies in each of three product categories: food manufacturing, beef jerky, and pet food industries. The 10 largest food manufacturing companies were identified using [Forbes Global 2000 list](#) for 2013. Companies selected for evaluation in our scorecard are confirmed to buy beef from South America: ConAgra and Hormel. For beef jerky, we identified the five largest companies utilizing the [Best-Selling Jerky Brands in Convenience Stores](#) from IRI Convenience AllScan data for 52 weeks ending January 26, 2014. We narrowed the beef jerky sector to the only company confirmed to source South American beef: Jack Link's. For pet food, we identified the five largest companies by utilizing [The World's Top 10 Pet Food Companies](#) from PetFoodIndustry.com. We narrowed the pet food sector lists to companies confirmed to source South American beef: Mars (owner of Mars Petcare) and Nestlé (owner of Nestlé Purina PetCare). For companies in the **retail sector**, we identified the top US-based companies from the food, drug, and discount retail store industries using the [2014 Forbes Global 2000 list](#). We confirmed that South American beef—as an ingredient in store brand items and/or fresh and frozen beef—is sold by three companies: Walmart, Safeway, and Kroger.

For companies in the **fast food sector**, we used [OSR Magazine's Global 30 list](#) (2012) to identify the 10 largest companies. We narrowed the list to the top five companies confirmed to sell beef products in their South American restaurants: McDonald's, Pizza Hut (owned by Yum! Brands), Burger King (owned by Restaurant Brands International), Subway, and Wendy's. For Pizza Hut and Burger King, we considered information from both their own websites and their parent company websites.

DOCUMENT SELECTION AND SCORING

Scoring was based on information from official company sources and Carbon Disclosure Project (CDP) reports. We collected company documents during the one month period from May 9, 2016 to June 9, 2016. One or more representatives from each company were contacted to let them know the company would be scored on its beef commitments. Although we did our own independent research to uncover all relevant materials from a company's website and the CDP website, this contact was made to allow companies the opportunity to weigh in in the unlikely event that an important document was overlooked. Companies could earn additional points in the categories of Compliance; Transparency; and Traceability, Monitoring, and Verification if further details were given in correspondence between the Union of Concerned Scientists (UCS) and the company. However, the company must have allowed UCS to publicly cite any information given for it to be considered for points.

Both authors independently scored all companies. The authors then compared their scores and reviewed places where they differed until consensus was reached. The detailed scoring rubrics for each company were then reviewed by additional members of the UCS staff and external reviewers. Their feedback was considered and scores were further refined. Where uncertainties still remained, UCS staff contacted company representatives for further clarification.

SCORING CRITERIA

All 13 companies were scored using the below criteria. UCS developed the criteria, with consideration given to feedback from external experts. The criteria and notes that explain them can be found below.

Notes:

- Overall categories and total possible points that could be earned in each category are highlighted in gray. There are five categories: ambition of deforestation-free commitment; time-bound implementation plan; compliance; transparency; and traceability, monitoring, and verification. Rows highlighted in tan separate the subsections within a category.
- We use the term *beef* to refer to fresh beef, frozen beef, beef jerky, offal (often found in pet food), and canned corned beef. *Cattle products* refers to beef AND by- and co-products, which include tallow, leather, gelatin, and glycerol.
- Companies were evaluated in the “Traceability, Monitoring and Verification” category for their purchases of beef only, not of all cattle products.
- For simplicity’s sake, companies lost points in the "Ambition of Deforestation-Free Commitment" category for a commitment that covers only beef, not all cattle products, and/or is not global but covers only a certain region. We did not dock points for each potentially applicable subsection throughout the scorecard. For instance, a company was docked points for having a cattle commitment that covers only the Brazilian Amazon in the "Ambition of Deforestation-Free Commitment" category but was not docked again in the "Traceability" category for tracing supplying ranches only in the Brazilian Amazon.
- We considered only public information available in English due to language barrier constraints. Because we evaluated large, international corporations headquartered in the United States or Europe (Switzerland), we do not expect this to impact scores significantly.
- The criteria list is restricted in its scope and does not extend to human rights safeguards. However, in order for beef supply chains to be responsible, they must also meet strict human and labor rights provisions in accordance with local, national, and international laws and norms.

Category	Possible Points (100 Total)
Ambition of Deforestation-Free Commitment	22
Company commits to protecting all forests, including secondary, disturbed, or high carbon stock forests	3
Company commits to protecting only primary forests or high conservation value (HCV) areas	2
Company commits to zero gross deforestation	3
Company commits to zero net deforestation	1
Company has a global, cross-commodity deforestation commitment for all commodities in its supply chain	2
Company has a global, cross-commodity deforestation commitment for the four major forest-risk commodities—beef, soy, palm oil, and paper/wood products—as applicable (if company uses commodity)	1
Company deforestation commitment covers indirect purchases of animal feed	2
Company's beef-specific deforestation commitment includes all beef products and all other cattle products as applicable (if company uses other cattle products)	2
Company has a beef-specific deforestation commitment but does not include all cattle products (if company uses other cattle products)	1

Company's beef-specific deforestation commitment is global	8
Company's beef-specific deforestation commitment is applicable only to specific areas (e.g., the Brazilian Amazon)	4
Company requires supplying meatpackers to have a zero-deforestation commitment	2
Time-Bound Implementation Plan	11
Has time-bound implementation plan with intermediate performance-based benchmarks	7
Implementation plan has already been achieved or will be achieved by end of 2016	4
Implementation plan to be achieved by end of 2017 or 2018	3
Implementation plan to be achieved by end of 2019 or 2020	2
Implementation plan to be achieved beyond 2020	1
Compliance	10
Company has a public noncompliance protocol for supplying meatpackers in violation of its deforestation commitments	4
Company requires supplying meatpackers to or the company itself provides support to small ranchers transitioning to a deforestation-free operation	6
Transparency	22
Company reports annually and publicly on its progress toward meeting its goals	6
Company reports include volume and percentage of total products it is currently sourcing that meets its deforestation-free beef or cattle criteria	4
Company reports include either the volume or percentage of total products it is currently sourcing that meets its deforestation-free beef or cattle criteria	2
Company discloses names of supplying meatpackers	8
Company provides limited information on its supplying meatpackers or provides the geographical locations it sources from	5
Company requires traceability and monitoring data to be available publicly	4
Traceability, Monitoring, and Verification	35
Company's supplying meatpackers or the company itself currently maps direct and indirect supplying ranches	12
Company's supplying meatpackers or the company itself currently maps direct supplying ranches	8
Company or its supplying meatpackers use a map-based monitoring and verification process that covers all direct and indirect supplying ranches	12
Company or its supplying meatpackers use a map-based monitoring and verification process that covers only direct supplying ranches	8

Company's supplying meatpackers conduct third-party (or independent) audits	6
Company allows self-verification	1
Company requires data produced from audits to be public	5
Total	100