April 21, 2009

Mary D. Nichols, Chairman  
California Air Resources Board  
Headquarters Building  
1001 “I” Street  
Sacramento, CA 95812

Dear Chairman Nichols,

As scientists and economists with relevant expertise, we are writing to recommend that you include indirect land use change in the lifecycle analyses of heat-trapping emissions from biofuels and other transportation fuels. This policy will encourage development of sustainable, low-carbon fuels that avoid conflict with food and minimize harmful environmental impacts.

Our comments are relevant to the development of California’s Low Carbon Fuel Standard (LCFS), which the Air Resources Board (ARB) will consider for adoption in its April hearing, as well as other policies that evaluate lifecycle heat-trapping emissions from biofuels. For policies like the LCFS to successfully reduce GHG emissions, it is critical to include all major sources of emissions, including indirect land use emissions from biofuels.

We encourage you to investigate and include significant direct and indirect emissions from all fuels, including conventional petroleum, heavy oils, natural gas for transportation, oil sand-based fuels, and the range of fuels used to power electrified transportation, consistent with the best available science. However, you should not delay inclusion of known sources of emissions, including indirect emissions from biofuels, pending discovery of potential effects from other fuels.

Recent peer-reviewed research indicates that conventional biofuels can directly or indirectly result in substantial heat-trapping emissions through the conversion of forests and grasslands to croplands to accommodate biofuel production. Increased demand for crops to make fuel results in higher global commodity prices that can induce farmers in other countries to plow up sensitive, high-carbon ecosystems—including rain forests in South America and Southeast Asia. Previous lifecycle analyses did not adequately account for these emissions, giving biofuels credit for greater carbon savings than actually achieved.

There are uncertainties inherent in estimating the magnitude of indirect land use emissions from biofuels, but assigning a value of zero is clearly not supported by the science. The data on land use change indicate that the emissions related to biofuels are significant and can be quite large. Grappling with the technical uncertainty and developing a regulation based on the best available science is preferable to ignoring a major source of emissions. Over time, greater accuracy and detail in a more refined analysis can be reflected in future LCFS rulemakings.

The need to address uncertainties applies to other areas the analysis as well, and we urge you to evaluate the increasing use of nitrogen fertilizers and herbicides associated with greater biofuel production. In particular, nitrogen fertilizers enhance the emission of nitrous oxide—a powerful greenhouse gas in Earth’s atmosphere.
To spur innovation in low carbon fuels, the LCFS must send an accurate signal to the growing clean energy market. Strategic investment decisions should be based upon the best available data of the carbon footprint of alternative fuels. Failure to include a major source of pollution, like indirect land use emissions, will distort the carbon market, suppress investment in truly low carbon fuels, and ultimately result in higher emissions.

The work you are doing in California sets an important precedent for transportation fuel policy nationally and internationally, as well as for action to confront climate change more broadly. We urge you to ensure that your policies are based on the best science, including consideration of emissions from indirect changes in land use.

Sincerely,

- Original Authors -

PAM MATSON, Ph.D.
Chester Naramore Dean of the School of Earth Sciences
Richard and Rhoda Goldman Professor of Environmental Studies
Stanford University
Stanford, CA
Member of the United States National Academy of Sciences

STUART L. PIMM, Ph.D.
Doris Duke Professor of Conservation Ecology
Nicholas School of the Environment and Earth Sciences
Duke University
Durham, NC

WILLIAM SCHLESINGER, Ph.D.
President
Cary Institute of Ecosystem Studies
Millbrook, NY
Member of the United States National Academy of Sciences

PETER C. FRUMHOFF, Ph.D.
Director of Science and Policy
Chief Scientist, Climate Campaign
Union of Concerned Scientists
Cambridge, MA

W. MICHAEL HANEMANN, Ph.D.
Chancellor's Professor
Department of Agricultural and Resource Economics
University of California, Berkeley
Berkeley, CA
Organizational affiliations are for identification purposes only.

KENNETH ARROW, Ph.D.
Palo Alto, CA
Nobel Laureate, Economics
Recipient of the United States National Medal of Science

DAVID GIBSON, Ph.D.
Professor Emeritus
University of Iowa
Iowa City, IA
Member of the United States National Academy of Sciences

FRANK WILCZEK, Ph.D.
Herman Feshbach Professor of Physics
Physics
Massachusetts Institute of Technology
Cambridge, MA
Nobel Laureate, Physics
Member of the United States National Academy of Sciences
MacArthur Fellow

RICHARD HOUGHTON, Ph.D.
Acting Director
Woods Hole Research Center
Falmouth, MA

ROBERT KATES, Ph.D.
Trenton, ME
Member of the United States National Academy of Sciences
MacArthur Fellow

F. CHAPIN, III, Ph.D.
Professor of Ecology
Institute of Arctic Biology
University of Alaska Fairbanks
Fairbanks, AK
Member of the United States National Academy of Sciences

THOMAS E. LOVEJOY, Ph.D.
Heinz Center Biodiversity Chair
The H. John Heinz III Center for Science, Economics and the Environment
Member of the United States National Academy of Sciences

WILLIAM CLARK, Ph.D.
Professor
Kennedy School of Government
Harvard University
Cambridge, MA
Member of the United States National Academy of Sciences
MacArthur Fellow

MICHAEL O'HARE, Ph.D.
Professor of Public Policy
Goldman School of Public Policy
University of California, Berkeley
Berkeley, CA

RICHARD AMBROSE, Ph.D.
Professor
Environmental Health Sciences
University of California, Los Angeles
Los Angeles, CA

BEVIN ASHENMILLER, Ph.D.
Assistant Professor of Economics
Occidental College
Los Angeles, CA

PETER BAYLEY, Ph.D.
Fisheries and Wildlife Department
The Ohio State University
Corvallis, OR

KENNETH BERGMAN, Ph.D.
National Aeronautics and Space Administration (retired)
Earth Sciences
Ashland, OR

JASMIN ANSAR, Ph.D.
Visiting Assistant Professor
Lorry Lokey Business School
Mills College
Oakland, CA

DENNIS BALDOCCI, Ph.D.
Professor of Biometeorology
Environmental Science Policy and Management
University of California, Berkeley
Berkeley, CA

DONALD BOESCH, Ph.D.
President
University of Maryland, Center for Environmental Science
Cambridge, MD

LOWELL ASHBAUGH, Ph.D.
Project Scientist
Crocker Nuclear Laboratory
University of California, Davis
Davis, CA

EDWARD BARBIER, Ph.D.
John S. Bugas Professor of Economics
Economics and Finance
University of Wyoming
Laramie, WY
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Affiliation</th>
<th>Location</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SEVERIN BORENSTEIN, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Professor</td>
<td>Haas School and University of California Energy Institute</td>
<td>Berkeley, CA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHARLES BOYCE, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Assistant Professor</td>
<td>University of Chicago</td>
<td>Chicago, IL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GUY BRASSEUR, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Earth and Sun Systems Laboratory National Center for Atmospheric Research</td>
<td>Boulder, CO</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HOLGER BRIX, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Assistant Researcher</td>
<td>Atmospheric and Oceanic Sciences University of California, Los Angeles Los Angeles, CA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PETER BRUSSARD, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Professor Emeritus</td>
<td>Biology University of Nevada Reno, NV</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HAROLD BURSTYN, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Electrical Engineering and Computer Science Syracuse University Syracuse, NY</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHRISTOPHER BUSCH, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Economist Policy Director Center for Resource Solutions</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JOHN CAMPBELL, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Assistant Professor</td>
<td>College of Engineering University of California, Merced Merced, CA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PETER CHESSON, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Professor Ecology and Evolutionary Biology University of Arizona Tucson, AZ</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ROBERT CIFELLI, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Senior Research Scientist</td>
<td>Atmospheric Science Colorado State University Fort Collins, CO</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RAYMOND CLARKE, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Biology Sarah Lawrence College Bronxville, NY</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DANIEL COLBERT, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Executive Director Institute for Energy Efficiency University of California, Santa Barbara Santa Barbara, CA</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ALAN CUNNINGHAM, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Professor Emeritus Chemistry Monterey Peninsula College (retired) Carmel Valley, CA</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MARIA DAMON, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Assistant Professor Daniel J. Evans School of Public Affairs University of Washington Seattle, WA</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ERIC DAVIDSON, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Senior Scientist The Woods Hole Research Center Falmouth, MA</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PETER DORMAN, Ph.D.</td>
<td>The Evergreen State College Olympia, WA</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HADI DOWLATABADI, Ph. D.</td>
<td>Canada Research Chair Professor of Applied Mathematics and Global Change Institute for Resources Environment and Sustainability Liu Institute for Global Issues The University of British Columbia Vancouver, BC</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AMY DUNHAM, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Research Faculty Ecology and Evolutionary Biology Rice University Houston, TX</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HALLIE EAKIN, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Assistant Professor School of Sustainability Arizona State University Tempe, AZ</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BRENDA EKWURZEL, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Climate Scientist Climate Program Union of Concerned Scientists Washington, DC</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Y. FARZIN, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Professor Agricultural and Resource Economics University of California, Davis Davis, CA</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TRACY FELDMAN, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Postdoctoral Associate Biology University of Wisconsin - Stevens Point Stevens Point, WI</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PAUL FERRARO, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Associate Professor of Economics Department of Economics Georgia State University Atlanta, GA</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MELANIE FITZPATRICK, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Climate Scientist Climate Program Union of Concerned Scientists Cambridge, MA</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ALLISON FLEGEL, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Adjunct Assistant Professor Geography University of Cincinnati Cincinnati, OH</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JOHANNES FOUFOPOULOS, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Assistant Professor School of Natural Resources University of Michigan Ann Arbor, MI</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ROBERT GAMACHE, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Professor Environmental, Earth, and Atmospheric Science University of Massachusetts Lowell Lowell, MA</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CATHERINE GAUTIER, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Professor Geography University of California, Santa Barbara Santa Barbara, CA</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BART GEERTS, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Associate Professor Atmospheric Science University of Wyoming Laramie, WY</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Institution</td>
<td>Location</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rainer Lohmann, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Assistant Professor</td>
<td>Graduate School of Oceanography, University of Rhode Island</td>
<td>Narragansett, RI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>John Lorand, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Professor Emeritus</td>
<td>Chemistry, Central Michigan University, Mt. Pleasant, MI</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stephen Manning, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Professor of Biology</td>
<td>Biology, Arkansas State University - Beebe, Beebe, AR</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Petrus Martens, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Astrophysicist</td>
<td>Smithsonian Astrophysical Observatory, Cambridge, MA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jeremy Martin, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Senior Scientist</td>
<td>Clean Vehicles, Union of Concerned Scientists, Washington, DC</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Michael McCormick, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Assistant Professor</td>
<td>Biology, Hamilton College, Clinton, NY</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Margaret Mellon, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Senior Scientist and Director</td>
<td>Food and Environment Program, Union of Concerned Scientists, Washington, DC</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zewei Miao, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Research Associate</td>
<td>Energy Biosciences Institute, University of Illinois, Urbana, IL</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>David Mitchell, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Associate Research Professor</td>
<td>Division of Atmospheric Sciences, Desert Research Institute, Reno, NV</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ronald Mitchell, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Professor</td>
<td>Political Science, University of Oregon, Eugene, OR</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>David Modarelli, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Professor</td>
<td>Chemistry, University of Akron, Akron, OH</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>William Moomaw, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Professor</td>
<td>Center for International Environment and Resource Policy, Tufts University, Medford, MA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>K. Murray, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Professor of Biology</td>
<td>Biology, Hope College, Holland, MI</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roni Neff, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Research Associate</td>
<td>Environmental Health Sciences, Johns Hopkins Bloomberg School of Public Health, Baltimore, MD</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charles Nelson, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Professor of Physics</td>
<td>Physics, State University of New York, Binghamton, NY</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>John Nielsen-Gammon, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Professor</td>
<td>Atmospheric Sciences, Texas A&amp;M University, College Station, TX</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Richard Norgaard, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Professor of Energy and Resources</td>
<td>University of California, Berkeley, Berkeley, CA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gretchen North, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Associate Professor</td>
<td>Biological Sciences, Occidental College, Los Angeles, CA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reed Noess, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Davis-Shine Distinguished Professor</td>
<td>Biology, University of Central Florida, Orlando, FL</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Michael Palmer, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Regents Professor</td>
<td>Botany, Oklahoma State University, Stillwater, OK</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Martin Polz, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Professor</td>
<td>Civil and Environmental Engineering, Massachusetts Institute of Technology, Cambridge, MA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R. Rau, Ph.D.</td>
<td></td>
<td>Physics, Brookhaven National Laboratory (retired), Bellport, NY</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dorothy Read, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Professor Emerita</td>
<td>Biology, University of Massachusetts Dartmouth, Dartmouth, MA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Michael Reich, Ph.D.</td>
<td></td>
<td>Economics, University of California, Berkeley, Berkeley, CA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peter Reynolds, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Adjunct Professor</td>
<td>Physics, North Carolina State University, Raleigh, NC</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jane Rissler, Ph.D.</td>
<td></td>
<td>Senior Scientist and Deputy Director, Food and Environment Program, Union of Concerned Scientists, Washington, DC</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>George Robinson, Ph.D.</td>
<td></td>
<td>Biological Sciences, University of Albany, State University of New York, Albany, NY</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diane Rocheleau, Ph.D.</td>
<td></td>
<td>Associate Professor, Geography, Clark University, Worcester, MA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jeff Romm, Ph.D.</td>
<td></td>
<td>Professor, Environmental Science, Policy and Management, University of California, Berkeley, Berkeley, CA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thomas Rooney, Ph.D.</td>
<td></td>
<td>Assistant Professor, Biological Sciences, Wright State University, Dayton, OH</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
RAY WEISS, Ph.D.  
Distinguished Professor  
Scripps Institution of Oceanography  
University of California, San Diego  
La Jolla, CA

SONIA YEH, Ph.D.  
Research Engineer  
The Institute of Transportation Studies  
University of California, Davis  
Davis, CA

VINCENT GUTSCHICK, Ph.D.  
Las Cruces, NM

HAROLD HARRIS, Ph.D.  
St. Louis, MO

MICHAEL WEISSMAN, Ph.D.  
Professor of Physics  
University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign  
Urbana, IL

THOMAS YUILL, Ph.D.  
Professor and Director Emeritus  
Nelson Institute for Environmental Studies  
University of Wisconsin-Madison  
Madison, WI

GRAINGER HUNT, Ph.D.  
Boise, ID

DOUG LAFOLLETTE, Ph.D.  
Madison, WI

STEPHEN WIEL, Ph.D.  
President of the Board  
Center for Law and Social Policy (CLASP)  
Washington, DC

HISAM ZERRIFFI, Ph.D.  
Ivan Head South/North Research Chair  
Liu Institute for Global Issues  
University of British Columbia  
Vancouver, BC

JUDITH LANG, Ph.D.  
Ophelia, VA

KRISTIN LEWIS, Ph.D.  
Cambridge, MA

ROBLEY WILLIAMS, Ph.D.  
Professor Emeritus  
Biological Sciences  
Vanderbilt University  
Nashville, TN

SIMONE ALIN, Ph.D.  
Seattle, WA

ROBERT MASON, Ph.D.  
Philadelphia, PA

MATTHEW AUER, Ph.D.  
Bloomington, IN

MOLLY McMUIRE, Ph.D.  
Lewisburg, PA

WILLIAM WILLIAMS, Ph.D.  
Professor  
Biology  
St. Mary’s College of Maryland  
Saint Marys City, MD

JEDEDEIAH BRODIE, Ph.D.  
Missoula, MT

KIRK MOLONEY, Ph.D.  
Ames, IA

HOWARD WILSHIRE, Ph.D.  
Research Geologist  
U.S. Geological Survey (retired)  
Sebastopol, CA

DAVID CAMPBELL, Ph.D.  
Tuscaloosa, AL

STEPHEN MUDRICK, Ph.D.  
Columbia, MO

HENDRIK WOLFF, Ph.D.  
Economics  
University of Washington  
Seattle, WA

MARK CHANDLER, Ph.D.  
Madison, WI

SIOBHAN REILLY, Ph.D.  
Oakland, CA

BRUCE COLLETTE, Ph.D.  
Washington, DC

CARLYLE STORM, Ph.D.  
Kingston, RI

COLIN WRAIGHT, Ph.D.  
Professor and Head  
Biochemistry  
University of Illinois  
Urbana, IL

JOHN COOPER, Ph.D.  
Lewisburg, PA

CLAUDIA TEBALDI, Ph.D.  
Princeton, NJ

CHRIS FOREST, Ph.D.  
University Park, PA

MAIKEN WINTER, Ph.D.  
Ithaca, NY

Organizational affiliations are for identification purposes only.

cc. Governor Arnold Schwarzenegger  
Lisa P. Jackson, Administrator, US-Environmental Protection Agency  
Linda Adams, Secretary, Cal-EPA  
Mike Scheible, Deputy Director, Air Resources Board  
Karen Douglas, Commissioner, California Energy Commission  
David Crane, Special Advisor for Jobs & Economic Growth, Office of Governor Schwarzenegger