

**NOW OR NEVER:
Serious New Plans to Save a
Natural Pest Control**

Contributions by

David Andow
David Ferro
Fred Gould
William Hutchison
Bruce Tabashnik
Mark Whalon

Edited by

Margaret Mellon
Jane Rissler

Union of Concerned Scientists
1998

Union of Concerned Scientists
Two Brattle Square
Cambridge, Massachusetts 02238

Copyright 1998 by the Union of Concerned Scientists

All rights reserved.

Printed on recycled paper.

The Union of Concerned Scientists (UCS), an independent nonprofit organization, is dedicated to advancing responsible public policies in areas where science and technology play a critical role. Established in 1969, UCS works in partnership with scientists and citizens to address serious environmental and security threats facing humanity.

UCS is currently working to encourage responsible stewardship of the global environment and life-sustaining resources; promote energy technologies that are renewable, safe, and cost effective; reform transportation policy; curtail weapons proliferation; and promote sustainable agriculture.

Recognizing the impacts of agricultural practices on food security, environmental protection, and economic prosperity, the UCS Agriculture and Biotechnology Program advocates sustainable agriculture policies. The program promotes agricultural methods that minimize pesticide, fertilizer, and energy use, and evaluates the risks and benefits of biotechnology in agriculture.

More information on UCS and the Agriculture and Biotechnology Program is available at the UCS Web site at www.ucsusa.org.

Copies of *Now or Never: Serious New Plans to Save a Natural Pest Control* are available for \$14.95 plus 20% shipping and handling from UCS Publications Department N, Two Brattle Square, Cambridge, MA 02238-9105; or call 617-547-5552. UCS Sponsors may purchase copies for \$11.95 plus 20% shipping and handling.

CONTRIBUTORS

David Andow, Ph.D.

Department of Entomology
University of Minnesota

David Ferro, Ph.D.

Department of Entomology
University of Massachusetts

Fred Gould, Ph.D.

Department of Entomology
North Carolina State University

William Hutchison, Ph.D.

Department of Entomology
University of Minnesota

Bruce Tabashnik, Ph.D.

Department of Entomology
University of Arizona

Mark Whalon, Ph.D.

Pesticide Research Center
Michigan State University

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

We are grateful to the six contributors for their hard work and commitment to this project. In midsummer, the Union of Concerned Scientists (UCS) asked them to analyze existing resistance management plans and write first-class plans for Bt corn, cotton, and potato in time to be implemented before the 1998 growing season. In late September, the contributors and UCS staff met in Washington to discuss early drafts and solidify plans for the final report. Over the following months, the scientists, working in pairs, exchanged several drafts of their chapters with UCS and each other. One draft was reviewed by twelve other scientists, who are listed below.

The scientists are the sole authors of their chapters. UCS placed no constraints on the substance of their analysis or recommendations. The six contributors do not necessarily agree with or endorse UCS's observations and recommendations.

Among the many other people who contributed to this report, we extend special thanks to Cheryl Siebert and Teri Grimwood for producing the final report for printing, Anita Spiess for editing the final draft, and Yuri Kant for performing the myriad tasks necessary to complete this project. Eason Associates, Inc., designed the cover.

We are grateful to the following persons who reviewed all or parts of the three chapters on crop-specific management plans: Brian Baker, Michael Caprio, Rebecca Goldberg, Richard Hellmich, George Kennedy, Randy Luttrell, William McGaughey, Richard Roush, and Eric Sideman. Three industry reviewers requested anonymity. While we appreciate the valuable advice and information provided by the reviewers, this report does not necessarily reflect their opinions. UCS and the six contributors are responsible for any errors in their respective chapters.

The project to save Bt and the other work of the UCS Agriculture and Biotechnology Program are supported by grants from the C.S. Fund, The Educational Foundation of America, Clarence E. Heller Charitable Foundation, HKH Foundation, The Joyce Foundation, Mary R. Morgan, and Newman's Own; and by contributions from UCS sponsors and the UCS Solutions Capital Campaign.

Margaret Mellon, Ph.D., J.D.
Jane Rissler, Ph.D.
Union of Concerned Scientists
January 1998

CONTENTS

Chapter 1	UCS Introduction.....	1
	Margaret Mellon	
Chapter 2	Contributors' Introduction.....	12
	Fred Gould, Bruce Tabashnik, William Hutchison, David Ferro, David Andow, Mark Whalon	
Chapter 3	Bt-Corn Resistance Management.....	18
	David Andow and William Hutchison	
Chapter 4	Bt-Cotton Resistance Management.....	65
	Fred Gould and Bruce Tabashnik	
Chapter 5	Bt-Potato Resistance Management.....	106
	Mark Whalon and David Ferro	
Appendices.....		134
	Appendix A: Bt Crops Approved for Field Testing by the US Department of Agriculture, 1987-1997.	
	Appendix B: Microbial Bt Insecticide Use in US Crop Production, by Crop and State, 1992.	
	Appendix C: Microbial Bt Insecticide Use in US Crop Production, by Crop, 1992.	
Glossary.....		147

