

# **International Scientists and Economists Statement on Biofuels and Land Use**

## **A letter to the European Commission**

As scientists and economists involved in the field of climate, energy, and land use, we are writing to you to recommend that policies recognize and account for indirect land use change as a part of the lifecycle analyses of greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions from biofuels. This will encourage development of sustainable, low-carbon fuels that avoid conflict with food production and minimize harmful environmental impacts.

Our comments are relevant to your deliberations on indirect land use change emissions in the context of the Renewable Energy and Fuel Quality Directives. For policies like these to successfully reduce GHG emissions, it is critical to include all major sources of emissions, including those associated with changes in land use.

Peer-reviewed research over the last several years, including studies commissioned by the European Commission, indicates that conventional biofuels can directly or indirectly result in substantial GHG emissions through the conversion of forests and grasslands to croplands or pasture to accommodate biofuel production. Increased demand for crops to make fuel results in higher global commodity prices that can induce farmers in other countries to plow up new ground, including sensitive, high-carbon ecosystems such as tropical forests in South America and Southeast Asia or peatland in Southeast Asia. The conditions for this to occur are not relegated to the future, but are already in place. The Directives do not currently account for these emissions in their lifecycle analysis or elsewhere, giving biofuels credit for greater carbon savings than actually achieved.

There are uncertainties inherent in estimating the magnitude of indirect land use emissions from biofuels, but a policy that implicitly or explicitly assigns a value of zero is clearly not supported by the science. All the studies of land use change indicate that the emissions related to biofuels expansion are significant and can be quite large. Exhaust pipe emissions for biofuels are, by convention, ignored in performing lifecycle GHG emissions analysis for biofuels. This accounting convention is flawed, as was described in the opinion of the European Environment Agency Scientific Committee on 15 September 2011.<sup>1</sup> To justify the omission of exhaust pipe emissions, it is essential to account for changes in land use.

The current scientific understanding is sufficient to warrant immediate action, as has already been recognized in the U.S. federal Renewable Fuel Standard and California Low Carbon Fuels Standard. A regulation based on a robust framework of science can be adjusted as the analysis matures. Without addressing land use change, the European Union's target for renewable energy in transport may fail to deliver genuine carbon savings in the real world. It could end up as merely an exercise on paper that promotes widespread deforestation and higher food prices.

It has been suggested that higher GHG thresholds for direct emissions are an adequate substitute for accounting for indirect land use change emissions. However, a problem in the accounting cannot be fixed by changing the threshold. A complete accounting is essential to assuring that promised carbon reductions

---

<sup>1</sup> <http://www.eea.europa.eu/about-us/governance/scientific-committee/sc-opinions/opinions-on-scientific-issues/sc-opinion-on-greenhouse-gas>

***International Scientists and Economists Statement on Biofuels and Land Use***  
*Preliminary list of signers – Does not include all signers and signer information/awards.*  
*Organizations are listed for identification purposes only.*

are credible. Flawed accounting could even encourage greater expansion of biofuels that cause damaging changes in land use, as described in the September 15 EEA Scientific Committee opinion.

Biofuels policies should encourage a growing clean energy market and create jobs producing low carbon biofuels that avoid land use change. Strategic investment decisions must be based upon the best available assessments of the GHG emissions of alternative fuel pathways. Promptly establishing a credible framework that includes indirect land use change will signal the market to invest in biofuels that minimize deforestation and competition with food.

The president of the commission has pledged "a fundamental review of the way EU institutions access and use scientific advice."<sup>2</sup> We urge you to align the EU biofuels policy with the best scientific knowledge and take into account emissions from indirect changes in land use.

**Sincerely,**

Daniel Kammen, Ph.D.  
Chief Technical Specialist for Renewable Energy and Energy Efficiency  
World Bank  
Washington, DC United States

Stuart Pimm, Ph.D.  
Doris Duke Professor of Conservation Ecology  
Duke University  
Durham, NC United States

Thomas Lovejoy, Ph.D.  
Heinz Center Biodiversity Chair  
The H. John Heinz III Center for Science, Economics and the Environment  
Washington, DC United States

Peter Frumhoff, Ph.D.  
Director of Science and Policy  
Chief Scientist, Climate Campaign  
Union of Concerned Scientists  
Cambridge, MA United States

Kenneth Arrow, Ph.D.  
Professor Emeritus  
Stanford University  
Stanford, CA United States  
Nobel Memorial Prize in Economics  
Lead Author for Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change

---

<sup>2</sup><http://europa.eu/rapid/pressReleasesAction.do?reference=SPEECH/09/391&format=HTML&aged=0&language=EN&guiLanguage=en>

***International Scientists and Economists Statement on Biofuels and Land Use***  
*Preliminary list of signers – Does not include all signers and signer information/awards.*  
*Organizations are listed for identification purposes only.*

William Schlesinger, Ph.D.  
President  
Cary Institute of Ecosystem Studies  
Millbrook, NY United States

William Laurance, Ph.D.  
Distinguished Research Professor  
James Cook University  
Smithfield, Australia

James Fay, Ph.D.  
Professor Emeritus  
Massachusetts Institute of Technology  
Weston, MA United States

Helmut Haberl, Ph.D.  
Professor  
Alpen-Adria Universitat  
Vienna, Austria

Daniel Tan, Ph.D.  
Senior Lecturer  
The University of Sydney  
Sydney, Australia

Matteo Campioli, Ph.D.  
University of Antwerp  
Antwerp, Belgium

Rudy van Diggelen, Ph.D.  
Professor  
University of Antwerp  
Antwerpen, Belgium

Aviel Verbruggen, Ph.D.  
Full Professor  
University of Antwerp  
Antwerp, Belgium

Sara Vicca, Ph.D.  
University of Antwerp  
Wilrijk, Belgium

Judi Krzyzanowski, Ph.D.  
Krzyzanowski Consulting / UBC  
Stirling-Rawdon, ON Canada

Jyrki Jauhiainen, Ph.D.  
Research Coordinator  
University of Helsinki  
Helsinki, Finland

Jan Kunnas, Ph.D.  
University of Jyvaskyla  
Jyvaskyla, Finland

Ilkka Savolainen, Ph.D.  
VTT Technical Research Centre of Finland  
Espoo, Finland

Bruno Dorin, Ph.D.  
Researcher  
Cirad  
Montpellier, France

Tonya Lander, Ph.D.  
INRA  
Avignon, France

Philippe Quirion, Ph.D.  
Researcher  
CNRS  
Paris, France

Karlheinz Knickel, Ph.D.  
Sustainability Strategies and Innovation  
SD INNOVATION  
Frankfurt, Germany

Karachepone Ninan, Ph.D.  
Professor  
Institute for Social and Economic Change  
Bangalore, India

***International Scientists and Economists Statement on Biofuels and Land Use***  
*Preliminary list of signers – Does not include all signers and signer information/awards.*  
*Organizations are listed for identification purposes only.*

Eswaran Somanathan, Ph.D.  
Professor  
Indian Statistical Institute  
New Delhi, India

Henry Neufeldt, Ph.D.  
ICRAF  
Nairobi, Kenya

Jose Luis Martinez, Ph.D.  
Universidad de Tabasco  
Villahermosa, Mexico

Prem Bindraban, Ph.D.  
Director ISRIC  
ISRIC - World Soil Information  
Wageningen, Netherlands

Aljosja Hooijer, Ph.D.  
Senior Adviser  
Deltares  
Delft, Netherlands

Agata Klimkowska, Ph.D.  
Researcher  
Foundation Bargerveen  
Nijmegen, Netherlands

Dirk Strijker, Ph.D.  
Professor  
Groningen University  
Groningen, Netherlands

Eirik Romstad, Ph.D.  
Senior Research Fellow  
Norwegian University of Life Sciences  
Aas, Norway

Daigee Shaw, Ph.D.  
Research Fellow  
Academia Sinica  
Taipei, Taiwan

Simon Lewis, Ph.D.  
Royal Society Research Fellow  
University of Leeds  
London, United Kingdom

Susan Page, Ph.D.  
Head of Department  
University of Leicester  
Leicester, United Kingdom

Jorn Scharlemann, Ph.D.  
Senior Scientist  
UNEP-WCMC  
Cambridge, United Kingdom

Bruce Wright, Ph.D.  
Executive Director  
Conservation Science Institute  
Palmer, AK United States

Carolyn Enquist, Ph.D.  
University of Arizona  
Tucson, AZ United States

Justin Schmidt, Ph.D.  
Biologist  
Southwestern Biological Institute  
Tucson, AZ United States

Richard Ambrose, Ph.D.  
Professor  
University of California, Los Angeles  
Agoura Hills, CA United States

Linda Anderson, Ph.D.  
Researcher  
UCSC  
Felton, CA United States

Nathah Carlson, Ph.D.  
California Lutheran University  
Thousand Oaks, CA United States

***International Scientists and Economists Statement on Biofuels and Land Use***  
*Preliminary list of signers – Does not include all signers and signer information/awards.*  
*Organizations are listed for identification purposes only.*

Anne Cohen, Ph.D.  
Honorable Research. Fellow,  
California Academy Science  
San Rafael, CA United States

Erin Conlisk, Ph.D.  
University of California, Riverside  
San Diego, CA United States

Jed Fuhrman, Ph.D.  
Professor (endowed chair)  
University of Southern California  
Topanga, CA United States

David Gallo, Ph.D.  
Professor Emeritus  
California State University, Chico  
Chico, CA United States

Megan Hall, Ph.D.  
Project Scientist  
University of California, Berkeley  
Berkeley, CA United States

John Harte, Ph.D.  
Professor of Ecosystem Sciences  
University of California, Berkeley  
Berkeley, CA United States

Karen Holl, Ph.D.  
Professor  
University of California, Santa Cruz  
Felton, CA United States

John Holtzclaw, Ph.D.  
San Francisco, CA United States

Julie Jedlicka, Ph.D.  
Postdoctoral Fellow  
University of California, Berkeley  
El Cerrito, CA United States

Sherman Lewis, Ph.D.  
Professor Emeritus  
California State Univeristy, East Bay  
Hayward, CA United States

Dustin Mulvaney, Ph.D.  
Professor of Sustainable Energy Resource  
San Jose State University  
San Jose, CA United States

Michael O'Hare, Ph.D.  
Professor of Public Policy  
University of California, Berkeley  
Berkeley, CA United States

Richard Plevin, Ph.D.  
Assistant Research Engineer  
University of California, Berkeley  
Berkeley, CA United States

Mathias van Thiel, Ph.D.  
Hayward, CA United States

Howard Wilshire, Ph.D.  
Research Geologist  
Sebastopol, CA United States

Julie Witcover, Ph.D.  
University of California - Davis  
Davis, CA United States

David Armstrong, Ph.D.  
Professor Emeritus  
Unversity of Colorado-Boulder  
Loveland, CO United States

JoAnne Howe, Ph.D.  
Professor Emeritus of Economics  
University of Colorado-Boulder  
Boulder, CO United States

***International Scientists and Economists Statement on Biofuels and Land Use***  
*Preliminary list of signers – Does not include all signers and signer information/awards.*  
*Organizations are listed for identification purposes only.*

John McKean, Ph.D.  
Professor Emeritus  
Colorado State University  
Masonville, CO United States

Robin Chazdon, Ph.D.  
Professor  
University of Connecticut  
Storrs, CT United States

Jeremy Martin, Ph.D.  
Senior Scientist  
Union of Concerned Scientists  
Washington, DC United States

Jeffrey O'Hara, Ph.D.  
Agricultural Economist  
Union of Concerned Scientists  
Washington, DC United States

Linda Winston, Ph.D.  
Seaford, DE United States

Dick Glick, Ph.D.  
President  
CFR  
Tallahassee, FL United States

Gustav Paulay, Ph.D.  
Professor  
University of Florida  
Gainesville, FL United States

Tom Poulson, Ph.D.  
Jupiter, FL United States

Armando Tasistro, Ph.D.  
University of Georgia  
Watkinsville, GA United States

Michael Parke, Ph.D.  
University of Hawaii  
Honolulu, HI United States

Gabriel Peckham, Ph.D.  
Principal Investigator  
Black Ivory Biotech  
Honolulu, HI United States

Russ Benedict, Ph.D.  
Associate Professor  
Central College  
Pella, IA United States

Erwin Klaas, Ph.D.  
Professor Emeritus  
Iowa State University  
Ames, IA United States

Leslie Duram, Ph.D.  
Professor and Chair  
Southern Illinois University  
Carbondale, IL United States

Karen Glennemeier, Ph.D.  
Science Director  
National Audubon Society  
Wilmette, IL United States

Jason Koontz, Ph.D.  
Associate Professor and Co-Chair  
Augustana College  
Rock Island, IL United States

Gregory Owens, Ph.D.  
Richland Community College  
Decatur, IL United States

Lauren Quinn, Ph.D.  
Postdoctoral Researcher  
University of Illinois  
Urbana, IL United States

James Shapiro, Ph.D.  
Professor  
University of Chicago  
Chicago, IL United States

***International Scientists and Economists Statement on Biofuels and Land Use***  
*Preliminary list of signers – Does not include all signers and signer information/awards.*  
*Organizations are listed for identification purposes only.*

Edmond Zaborski, Ph.D.  
Visiting Research Scientist  
University of Illinois, Urbana-Champaign  
Mahomet, IL United States

George Bakken, Ph.D.  
Professor of Biology  
Indiana State University  
Terre Haute, IN United States

David Burress, Ph.D.  
President  
Ad Astra Institute of Kanss  
Lawrence, KS United States

Gilford Ikenberry, Ph.D.  
McPherson College  
McPherson, KS United States

Deborah Hill, Ph.D.  
Professor  
Univeristy of Kentucky  
Lexington, KY United States

Alfred Eipper, Ph.D.  
Ecologist  
Easthampton, MA United States

Susan Goldhor, Ph.D.  
Director  
Center for Applied Regional Studies  
Cambridge, MA United States

Elske Smith, Ph.D.  
Professor Emeritus  
Lenox, MA United States

D. Snyder, Ph.D.  
Professor Emeritus  
Amherst, MA United States

W. Reid Goforth, Ph.D.  
Port republic, MD United States

Amy Mckinney, Ph.D.  
Postdoctoral Research Associate  
Rocky Mountain Biological Laboratory  
United States

Tom Tietenberg, Ph.D.  
Mitchell Family Professor of Economics,  
Emeritus  
Colby College  
Waterville, ME United States

Edward Parson, Ph.D.  
Professor  
University of Michigan  
Ann Arbor, MI United States

Cyrus Bina, Ph.D.  
Distinguished Research Professor of  
Economics  
University of Minnesota, Morris  
Morris, MN United States

Margaret Kuchenreuther, Ph.D.  
University of Minnesota, Morris  
Morris, MN United States

Peter Reich, Ph.D.  
Professor  
University of Minnesota  
St Paul, MN United States

Tim Dickson, Ph.D.  
Michigan State University  
Hickory Corners, MO United States

Stephen Mudrick, Ph.D.  
Associate Professor Emeritus  
University of Missouri  
Columbia, MO United States

James Lazell, Ph.D.  
President  
The Conservation Agency  
Jackson, MS United States

***International Scientists and Economists Statement on Biofuels and Land Use***  
*Preliminary list of signers – Does not include all signers and signer information/awards.*  
*Organizations are listed for identification purposes only.*

Richard Bilborrow, Ph.D.  
Professor  
University of North Carolina  
Chapel Hill, NC United States

Jo Ellen Brandmeyer, Ph.D.  
Research Environmental Engineer 3  
RTI International  
Chapel Hill, NC United States

Daniel Graham, Ph.D.  
Adjunct Professor  
North Carolina State  
Chapel Hill, NC United States

David Grant, Ph.D.  
Professor Emeritus of Biology  
Davidson College  
Davidson, NC United States

Carol Seagle, Ph.D.  
Professor  
University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill  
Chapel Hill, NC United States

Thomas Struhsaker, Ph.D.  
Adjunct Professor  
Duke University  
Durham, NC United States

Nicanor Saliendra, Ph.D.  
Ecologist  
USDA ARS  
Mandan, ND United States

Hendrik Van Den Berg, Ph.D.  
Professor of Economics  
University of Nebraska  
Lincoln, NE United States

Ahmet Baytas, Ph.D.  
Professor of Economics  
Montclair State University  
Montclair, NJ United States

Ron Hutchison, Ph.D.  
Associate Professor of Biology  
Richard Stockton College  
Northfield, NJ United States

Vincent Gutschick, Ph.D.  
Director  
Global Change Consulting Consortium  
Las Cruces, NM United States

Rebecca Summer, Ph.D.  
Gila Regional Information Project  
Silver City, NM United States

Antonio Bento, Ph.D.  
Professor  
Cornell University  
Ithaca, NY United States

David Borton, Ph.D.  
RPI  
Troy, NY United States

Christopher Jensen, Ph.D.  
Assistant Professor  
Pratt Institute  
Brooklyn, NY United States

Andrew Nelson, Ph.D.  
State University of New York at Oswego  
Oswego, NY United States

Richard Ostfeld, Ph.D.  
Senior Scientist  
Cary Institute of Ecosystem Studies  
Red Hook, NY United States

Judith Weis, Ph.D.  
Professor  
Rutgers University  
New York, NY United States

Paula Gonzalez, Ph.D.  
Cincinnati, OH United States



***International Scientists and Economists Statement on Biofuels and Land Use***  
*Preliminary list of signers – Does not include all signers and signer information/awards.*  
*Organizations are listed for identification purposes only.*

David Gorchov, Ph.D.  
Professor  
Miami University  
Oxford, OH United States

David Modarelli, Ph.D.  
University of Akron  
Akron, OH United States

Stacy Philpott, Ph.D.  
University of Toledo  
Toledo, OH United States

Theresa Pretlow, Ph.D.  
Professor Emerita  
Case Western Reserve University  
Cleveland, OH United States

Gerald Sgro, Ph.D.  
John Carroll University  
Cleveland Heights, OH United States

Peter Bayley, Ph.D.  
Oregon State University  
Corvallis, OR United States

Frank Benford, Ph.D.  
Salem, OR United States

Kenneth Bergman, Ph.D.  
Ashland, OR United States

David Fuller, Ph.D.  
Brookings, OR United States

Barbara Roy, Ph.D.  
Professor  
University of Oregon  
Eugene, OR United States

William Stephen, Ph.D.  
Professor Emeritus  
Oregon State University  
Corvallis, OR United States

John Sorrentino, Ph.D.  
Associate Professor  
Temple University  
Ambler, PA United States

Edward Thornton, Ph.D.  
Professor of Chemistry  
University of Pennsylvania  
Swarthmore, PA United States

Eric Vonwettberg, Ph.D.  
Assistant Professor  
Florida International University  
Providence, RI United States

Vsevolod Gurevich, Ph.D.  
Professor  
Vanderbilt University  
Nashville, TN United States

Elin Pierce, Ph.D.  
Wildlife Biologist  
Millington, TN United States

Craig Linder, Ph.D.  
Associate Professor  
University of Texas at Austin  
Austin, TX United States

David Newburn, Ph.D.  
Assistant Professor  
Texas A&M University  
College Station, TX United States

Brian Shmaefsky, Ph.D.  
Professor of Biology  
Lone Star College, Kingwood  
Kingwood, TX United States

Phyllis Coley, Ph.D.  
Distinguished Professor of Biology  
University of Utah  
Salt Lake City, UT United States

***International Scientists and Economists Statement on Biofuels and Land Use***  
*Preliminary list of signers – Does not include all signers and signer information/awards.*  
*Organizations are listed for identification purposes only.*

John Cairns, Ph.D.  
University Distinguished Professor  
Virginia Tech  
Blacksburg, VA United States  
Member, National Academy of Sciences

John Cannon, Ph.D.  
Conservation Biologist  
Front Royal, VA United States

Robert Nadeau, Ph.D.  
Professor Environmental Science Public  
George Mason University  
Fairfax Station, VA United States

Marc Lapin, Ph.D.  
Middlebury College  
Cornwall, VT United States

Margaret Alic, Ph.D.  
Eastsound, WA United States

Bob Gillespie, Ph.D.  
Wenatchee Valley College  
Wenatchee, WA United States

David nelson, Ph.D.  
Ritzville, WA United States

Suzanne Hagell, Ph.D.  
Research Associate  
University of Wisconsin, Madison  
Madison, WI United States

Erica Young, Ph.D.  
University of Wisconsin  
Milwaukee, WI United States

Bart Geerts, Ph.D.  
Professor  
University of Wyoming  
Laramie, WY United States